RICHARD W. PFAFF, *THE LITURGY IN MEDIEVAL ENGLAND: A HISTORY* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 2009), ISBN 978-0-521-80847-7, xxviii+593pp, £80.

The stated aim of this book is to provide the first comprehensive historical treatment of the Latin liturgy in medieval England, focusing mainly on the mass and daily office. The scope of discussion comprises some one thousand years of liturgical history from early Anglo-Saxon England before St Augustine's mission to Canterbury in 597 to the time of the Reformation and the consequent Dissolution of the Monasteries in the course of the sixteenth century. It comprises an Introduction followed by fourteen chapters organized partly along chronological, partly along institutional, lines. Each contains multiple subheadings, and five chapters conclude with an Excursus encapsulating particular topics which appear more diffusely in the chronological accounts.

While the primary focus is on liturgical books, Pfaff endeavours to set these in context, with an eye to some of the circumstantial evidence, including archaeological (places) and canonical (rules such as are handed down at synods); hence he concerns himself largely with books connected with particular places, and, where possible, also with named individuals associated with them, including a critical overview of the contributions of modern liturgical scholars. And while not intended as a social history (still less an anthropological study) of English religious culture or *sentiment religieuse* [*sic*] (xiv), the author's aim is to incorporate ideas and motivations relating to liturgical practices in their many local and regional manifestations, as well as to the scholars engaged in their study. The rarity of this more anthropocentric approach is acknowledged where he states that 'the hundreds of names and places that crowd the General Index are vital, not incidental, to our story' (18).

In his introductory chapter, the author sets out a comprehensive overview of the materials and scope of the book, and goes into some detail to explain his approach and method of thinking; for example, he emphasizes his caution concerning the question of 'evidence': 'the presence of a particular text or rubric or feast in a service book is not firm evidence for actual *use* ...' (3); and also concerning the presumption of 'uniqueness' (4) in an environment where so much has been lost. Valuable also are his brief historiographical account (8–12), which is resumed at appropriate points in the chapters that follow, and an Excursus on sources: manuscripts and catalogues, church buildings and canonical materials for medieval England (20–29).

From the perspective of the twenty-first-century digital age, a book of this scope and density (in the positive sense) is a welcome reminder of just how much scholarship has gathered momentum in a little over a century. Much of the initial impetus came from England with the publications of the Plainsong and Medieval Music Society ('PMMS', founded in 1888) and the Henry Bradshaw Society ('HBS', founded in 1890), including Frederick Warren's catalogue of music manuscripts in

some of the principal libraries of Britain and Ireland (*Bibliotheca Musico-Liturgica*, two volumes, published, respectively, in 1894 and 1932 by the PMMS), as well as editions of liturgical source materials representing Hereford, Sarum and Westminster, among others, by scholars such as W. H. Frere; and in France (second in importance only to British libraries for collections of English source materials), the work of scholars such as Léopold Delisle (*Mémoire sur d'anciens sacramentaires*, 1886) and Victor Leroquais (catalogues of sacramentaries and missals, breviaries, psalters and pontificals in French public libraries published over the period 1924–41). Before that, the only texts available for scholarly consultation were published between 1642 and 1748 (32).

Pfaff openly admits to the 'work-in-progress' nature of the book—particularly for the earlier centuries of the period under consideration. Hence in the subtitle and elsewhere, he opts for the indefinite article rather than the more presumptuous 'the' (xiii), comparing his treatment of the subject to a tapestry with many loose threads and faded patches (1, 19), rather than to a mosaic where all the pieces form a coherent whole.

While addressing a specialist topic, the study is explicitly designed to be accessible to non-specialists. And even where certain knowledge might be assumed, readers are guided to appropriate secondary sources to assist with gaps in knowledge. The Introduction covers such headings as 'evidence', 'what the reader is presumed to know', 'historiography: the previous study of the subject', 'England and the Continent in medieval liturgy'; and a case is made for excluding two important topics, namely, music, and the episcopal and pastoral liturgies, for reasons of overall balance and, with respect to music in particular, the complexity of the topic and fitfulness of the evidence (14–15)—meaning that not all liturgical books contain music notation, and, furthermore, that this is a distinctive aspect of liturgical practice which requires its own specialist account. That said, the book is no less valuable for scholars of liturgical music, not only in its copious discussion of liturgical rites, rules and service books but also in its many references to chant and other sung texts.

Chapters two and three focus on Anglo-Saxon England, before and after the Augustinian mission, up to the eve of the Norman Conquest in the mid eleventh century. The situation of Christianity in late-Roman Britain prior to the arrival of St Augustine in Canterbury in 597 is as difficult to determine as is that in Ireland before the arrival of St Patrick in the early fifth century. We know that there were pre-Patrician Irish Christians, just as we know that there were British Christians before the Anglo-Saxon incursions. Suggestions of relations with the Irish Church fare slightly better. There are accounts, mainly from Bede (672/673–735), albeit somewhat subjective and partisan, of interaction between Irish Christians and Pictish and Anglo-Saxon communities, but very little hard evidence for liturgical practice apart from

exceptional, slightly later, sources such as the gospel-lectionary known as the Lindisfarne Gospels (*c*687) with its blend of Insular art and Italian-influenced texts (35). As is well known to students of early medieval Ireland, the question of 'insular' Christianity is indeed a complex one, and one where it is not only impossible but also probably unrealistic to try to separate the strands on grounds of ethnicity or proto-nationality. In this particular context one might mention also the presence of Anglo-Saxon students in Ireland, among them St Willibrord who was educated at Rath Melsigi (probably Clonmelsh, Co. Carlow, as identified by Dáibhí Ó Cróinín) from where he went to Frisia in 690 to establish at Echternach what is generally regarded as the first Anglo-Saxon mission to the Continent. There was also a strong Irish presence in Echternach.

The third dimension of early Anglo-Saxon culture-contact concerns the Franks, represented in the first instance by Queen Bertha (wife of King Ethelbert of Kent) and the Frankish Bishop Liudhard who served at the royal chapel at Canterbury. Again, while further evidence is lacking, Liudhard's presence provides a concrete historical marker for the presence of Gallican liturgical practice in Anglo-Saxon England (in addition to what might already have been in circulation, especially in other parts of the country through the already established Irish and British churches).

The picture becomes somewhat clearer with the arrival of St Augustine, represented by the famous 'St Augustine's Gospels' (now MS 286 in the Parker Library at Corpus Christi College, Cambridge), one of the books believed to have been brought by him to Canterbury in 597, still used to this day for the enthronement of the archbishop of Canterbury and other important national ceremonial occasions (for example, the service at Westminster Abbey for the visit of Pope Benedict XVI to Britain in 2010—an event rich in bridge-building symbolism such as the acknowledgement of a common Christian faith, represented by the Gospel book, and the beatification of John Henry Cardinal Newman). This seventh-century manuscript owes its presence in Cambridge, and perhaps its very survival, to Archbishop Matthew Parker (1504–75), Master of Corpus Christi College (its Parker Library is named after him), University Vice-Chancellor and subsequently Archbishop of Canterbury (1559–75), who played an important role in preserving manuscripts from destruction during the Dissolution of the Monasteries under Henry VIII.

An Excursus on the terms 'Gregorian and Gelasian' is followed by a survey of some of the principal liturgical books produced or used in late Anglo-Saxon England, from the late ninth or early tenth centuries up to (and slightly beyond) the Conquest initiated in 1066. Also addressed are the liturgy in the minsters and secular cathedrals, and the growing contact with Flanders and Brittany through the royal house of Wessex, under Athelstan (924–39). Detailed accounts are given of books such as the Leofric Missal, the Winchester tropers, Aethelwold's benedictional, together with a useful

summary of the contents of the *Regularis Concordia* which resulted from the Synod of Winchester (held in 970 or 972). As well as its provision of a 'harmony of the rule' for all monks and nuns of the 'English nation', the *Regularis Concordia* is particularly known for containing the earliest evidence for the dramatization of *Quem quaeritis?* ('Whom do you seek?'), the Matins ceremony of the Three Marys arriving at Christ's tomb on Easter morning, and the associated implications for the development (one hesitates to say 'origins') of liturgical drama.

Chapter four serves as a kind of lynchpin between the older and the reformed (for want of a better term) English Church, exploring the implications of the Norman Conquest and cross-fertilizations. Here Pfaff is at pains to emphasize the gradual and multifaceted nature of these changes, reminding his readers that no 'zero-points' existed in the process. In introducing the figure of Lanfranc, Abbot of St Stephen's, Caen, who became Archbishop of Canterbury in 1070, he states: 'we must keep in mind that he [i.e. Lanfranc] did not enter on a liturgical *tabula rasa*; in no sense is he the Norman equivalent of Augustine of Canterbury in the early 600s' (102). (A similar issue arises in the case of the Irish Church where the Norman Conquest has sometimes been seen as a watershed for liturgical reforms which, in fact, were already in progress from earlier in the twelfth century with the introduction of the continental religious orders by St Malachy.)

The chapter ranges in scope from Lanfranc's reforming *Constitutions* (written probably between 1077 and 1080) to Giso of Wells's sacramentary, Wulfstan of Worcester's *portiforium* and Leofric's liturgical programme at Exeter with its associated books. It contains a particularly interesting exploration of the question whether Lanfranc 'purged' Anglo-Saxon saints from the liturgy, replacing them with those favoured by the Norman church (118ff.), through a comparison of service books from Canterbury, Durham and Bec, and concludes with a very valuable Excursus on method in the comparison of liturgical texts. A fifth chapter, on the monastic liturgy, 1100–1215 (St Albans, Winchcombe, Sherborne, Glastonbury, Durham, Bury St Edmunds, Ely and Gloucester) closes with an Excursus on the ascription of liturgical books to particular monastic churches, using Bury St Edmunds as a test case.

From the twelfth century the source materials become much more plentiful. With the organization of the Black Monks into the Order of St Benedict, *c*1215, other orders ensued; as did the development of a more complex and separate secular clergy. This is marked in the book by a change from a mostly chronological account to a twin-track approach, the monastic and regular on the one hand, the secular on the other. The second tranche begins with an account of the Benedictine liturgy after 1215 (chapter six) as seen in sources from Norwich, Worcester, Tewkesbury, Evesham, Hyde Abbey, Westminster and Sherbourne. This is followed by chapters on books associated with

other monastic orders (7: Cluniacs, Cistercians, Carthusians); non-monastic religious orders (8: Augustinian, Premonstratensian, and Gilbertine canons regular); and the non-monastic orders of friars (9: Dominican, Franciscan, Carmelite and Austin), concluding with an Excursus on liturgical books from female religious houses.

A particularly important discussion is developed in the third tranche with a detailed account, in no fewer than four chapters (10–13), of the early development and spread of Sarum Use—one of the most over-generalized and misunderstood of all subjects in this field. Sarum is essentially an English variant (or variants) of the Roman Rite associated with Salisbury Cathedral, spreading thereafter throughout these islands while maintaining certain local features, particularly with regard to the veneration of local or regional saints. Its earliest documentation is from the thirteenth century, the time of the construction of the new cathedral. However, Pfaff takes a much longer-term view: beginning with the establishment of Old Sarum as the new centre of the episcopal see and in the absence of direct evidence, he explores three strands of possible influence on the early development of worship at Sarum (351–2), namely, (1) monastic, represented by the post-Conquest reconfiguration of dioceses which led to the move to Old Sarum in 1075 of Her(e)man, Lotharingian bishop of Sherbourne; (2) prebendal, represented by Hereman's successor, Osmund, a Norman clerk and possibly chancellor to William the Conqueror (Osmund established a full community of canons whose liturgical practices would have been modelled on secular cathedral practices); and (3) through comparisons with Crediton, Cornwall, where Leofric changed from a monastic to a secular community on the lines of Chrodegang of Exeter: the Leofric missal may serve as a possible model for the type of book familiar to the twelfth-century canons of Old Sarum. Pfaff presents an account of the sources ranging from the late twelfth century to the end of the fifteenth when the first printed Sarum service books were published. Although there are no Sarum manuscripts from the twelfth century, he refers to Leofric Missal 'C' as a possible guide to earlier forms of the rite which only reached its final, 'standard' form by the end of the fourteenth century.

Richard Poore, the hugely influential Bishop of Salisbury (1217–28), is commonly believed to have been responsible for the Sarum consuetudinary (thought to have been compiled between 1173 and 1220) and possibly for the (slightly older) Sarum ordinal. However, Pfaff questions this (367–9) while at the same time underlining Poore's central importance and influence, including his authorship of synodal statutes requiring all parish churches within the diocese to say mass in accordance with the Salisbury constitution (369). The first signs of the spread of the Use of Sarum to other dioceses occur at St Davids, Wales, in 1223, and by 1270 books from Bristol and the Isle of Wight indicate that Sarum Use was a distinct entity (though precisely what that meant is the subject of the ensuing section).

In the course of time, as Pfaff points out, the presence of the Salisbury Feast of Relics serves as one of the litmus tests for the spread of Sarum. In 1319 this feast was moved from 15 September to the Sunday following the Feast of the Translation of St Thomas Becket (7 July), in order to avoid a clash with the octave of the feast of Mary's Nativity (8 September), due to an increase in Marian devotion in the later thirteenth century.

Following a case study of Exeter Cathedral (chapter 12), for which far more evidence for actual liturgical life survives than for Salisbury, the fourth chapter in this tranche returns to southern England and Sarum Use in its final form. Here Pfaff addresses fundamental questions such as, 'Was there a *single* New Ordinal?' (414), and 'When is a missal a Sarum missal?' (421), and notes an interesting introduction of a *lingua materna* rubric found in several late medieval Sarum missals (419). This is applied to bidding prayers in the vernacular for church and king, and in a collect, also rubricated *lingua materna*, for the souls of deceased persons. In that case, it is not a regional variant but one used far more widely in the English Church. A third instance of use of the vernacular concerns the washing of relics on the Sarum Feast of Relics after the procession returns to the church. The rubric indicates that the names of the relics be read out in the vernacular. Again, this is found in a wide range of sources among which, interestingly, is a fifteenth-century Irish Sarum missal from Clonard, in the diocese of Meath, which is important for its inclusion of a mass for St Finian. Pfaff suggests that the *lingua materna* here might have been Gaelic, but I think English (or perhaps French, initially) more likely in that region, given its Anglo-Norman hegemony from the end of the twelfth century. (As with the cult of St Patrick and certain other Irish saints, St Finian of Clonard was vigorously promoted by the Anglo-Normans, in this case during the episcopacy of Thomas St Leger, Bishop of Meath, 1286–1320.)

Following a chapter on regional uses and local variety (14: York, Hereford, London, Lincoln and Wells; parish churches), a final chapter (15) is devoted to late medieval liturgies, taking as examples the Bridgettine Order and a selection of service books, both manuscript and printed, associated with particular individuals (e.g. Elizabeth Shelford and Lady Margaret Beaufort). In addition to a general index at the end, a separate Index of Manuscripts and an Index of Saints are also provided.

For those interested further in matters Irish, the inclusion of the feasts of SS Patrick and Laurence O'Toole in a late thirteenth or early fourteenth-century calendar associated possibly with an Oxford Franciscan house may suggest that it was written by an Irish friar (325–6). The feast of St Patrick is listed in a 1312 revised Carmelite ordinal (330) and he is named (along with Petroc and Winnoc) in a litany of the printed Sarum psalter (431). This last—referred to by Pfaff as representing the 'Celtic

fringe'—serves as a reminder of the need for more coordinated work between scholars of insular liturgical practices. While the absence, as yet, of a full survey of the liturgical cults of saints in the various medieval insular areas remains a major handicap, there is a growing body of new scholarship in Irish (as also both Scottish and Welsh) Church history and liturgical studies which demonstrates the misguidedness of the antiquarian notion of marginalized 'Celts' at any period for the topic under consideration.

In a study of such scope, packed with technical detail, generous footnotes and copious bibliographic references, there are very few typographic or other errors. However, it may be useful to mention that the Dublin Troper (Cambridge University Library, MS Add. 710) is incorrectly listed as '270' in the discussion (368) and in both indexes (557 and 577).

Lastly, the gathering together in one book of the materials for English liturgy, both printed and digital—not least the outstanding online resource that is the Parker Library at Corpus Christi College Cambridge: www.corpus.cam.ac.uk/parker/—is a timely reminder that there is still no equivalent for Irish (musico-)liturgical manuscript collections, to the endless frustration of scholars both in Ireland and abroad. Although there is a substantial quantity of material online for Gaelic and Hiberno-Latin textual sources, we have not even begun the work of making the corpus of liturgical manuscripts available in the public domain. Not only is the Dublin Troper (edited by René-Jean Hesbert) still the only Irish musico-liturgical MS available in facsimile, but it was a French initiative, published in Rouen in 1966—almost half a century ago! There appears to have been a studied (if that is the operative word) neglect of those elements of Irish cultural heritage which do not give prominence to the Celtic/Gaelic strand. And while attitudes have changed fundamentally in more recent decades, these are sadly not yet represented in any of the major publication initiatives, whether printed or digital.

In conclusion, it would be impossible in a brief review to do justice to the detail of this publication. Its systematic and thorough presentation of evidence is imbued throughout with the clarity of a well-developed pedagogical approach which, for all its concentrated detail, makes this highly specialized material accessible to the non-specialist, both professional and student alike. In this and other respects, the book lays down a marker for future work, for study not only of the liturgy in medieval England, but also of its influence in the greater insular area. It should remain an indispensable work of reference for a long time to come.

Ann Buckley

Trinity College Dublin