

ANN BUCKLEY (ED.), *MUSIC, LITURGY, AND THE VENERATION OF SAINTS OF THE MEDIEVAL IRISH CHURCH IN A EUROPEAN CONTEXT* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2017). ISBN: 9782503534701, 359 pp, €100 (hardback).

*Music, Liturgy, and the Veneration of Saints of the Medieval Irish Church in a European Context* is a welcome contribution to musicological research on liturgy and music in medieval Ireland, taking us on an intriguing journey of discovery and enquiry. The editor, Ann Buckley, divides the book into four main sections (with further subdivisions): 'Chant in the Early Irish Church', 'Issues of Time and Place', 'Offices of the Saints and Liturgy', and 'Theory and Practice'. Drawing on the expertise of scholars from a wide range of fields such as musicology, liturgy, hagiography, ecclesiastical history, textual/musical palaeography, and Celtic studies, we are immersed in thought-provoking questions and illuminating discussions which favour the kind of interdisciplinary approach that this book adopts. Many of the essays complement one another or, at times, share similar information. In her introduction, Buckley provides not only an informed summary of the contents of the book but also raises the problematic concept of a 'Celtic rite', which Liam Tracey re-addresses in great detail in the final essay. Throughout the course of this book, ten authors provide case studies of specific saints. They document the legacy of Irish saints in medieval Ireland and the Continent including national (and international saints) such as Sts Patrick, Brigit, Columba (Columcille), Brendan, and Fursa to that of lesser-known and sometimes newly-created saints such as St Finian (the former) or Sts Livinius and Sunniva (the latter).

As Michel Huglo states 'the liturgy of Ireland was at its origins a monastic liturgy'; in the first section, his enlightening essay, 'Chant in the Early Irish Church' refers, in particular, to liturgical psalters containing Irish script, the Irish hymnal in the Antiphonary of Bangor (Milan, Biblioteca Ambrosiana C.5 inf.) and the Stowe Missal (Dublin, Royal Irish Academy, MS D ii 3) as central sources of liturgical evidence. He sheds further light on the problematic (and controversial) question of identifying chants that may be categorized as 'Irish'. In the light of recent scholarship, we are familiar with Bruno Stäblein's identification of two antiphons that are non-Gregorian in their structure: *Ibunt sancti* and *Crucem sanctam* (Paris, Bibliothèque de l' Arsenal, MS 279, f.214v). Huglo's analysis identifies three additional Communion chants in the Antiphonary of Bangor with possible corresponding melodies from French sources, thus greatly enriching the current scant repertory. He concludes that the origins of early Irish chant are rooted firmly in the Gallican tradition.

The two essays in the second section focus on the cult of saints in different ways. Barbara Hagg-Huglo outlines the development of the *Historia* genre from the early

Middle Ages to the later period, providing a wealth of information and pertinent links for the study of Offices of Irish saints. The second part of her discussion focuses on the intriguing case of a 'meticulously invented patron saint of Ghent'. The veneration of St Livinius had far reaching effects, originating in Ghent but extending as far away as Eastern Europe. This successful invention is a tribute to the high esteem with which the medieval Irish missionaries were held on the Continent. An appropriate follow up to this article is Nils Holger Petersen's discussion about the 'Locality and Distance in Cults of Saints in Medieval Norway' in which he illustrates the power of 'the cultural memory of the saint' in shaping the creation of a new figure out of legends and myths. This powerful essay delves deeply into the complexity and effect of cultural memory, taking as a case study, the possibly fictitious Irish princess, St Sunniva, who occupies a significant place among the medieval Scandinavian martyrs.

Section three contains the central material of the book and is itself subdivided into three sections focussing on saints' offices both in Continental and Insular sources. Jean-Michel Picard reveals important liturgical witnesses, testifying to the cult of Irish saints including Patrick, Brigit, Columcille, Brendan, and Columbanus in Europe, where they also attained widespread universal status. For example, Irish and Breton saints are present in a tenth-century Psalter (Cathedral Library, Salisbury, MS 180). Medieval hagiographers produced *Vitae* of Irish saints for various reasons in promoting their veneration and patronage. Surprisingly, we find the earliest witness to the Life (*Vita*) of St Brigit is not attested in an Irish source but originates in a ninth-century manuscript from Northern France (Reims, Bibliothèque Municipale, MS 296); in fact, Picard asserts that her 'universal appeal' gave rise to the composition of numerous *Vitae* 'from Brittany to Bohemia and down to Benevento and Naples'.

How many manuscripts contain chants for Irish saints? Drawing on the *Analecta Hymnica Medii Aevi*, Sara G. Casey's comparative study refers to some three hundred sources containing chant for thirty-nine Irish saints. (A list of these sources in an appendix would be very welcome to the reader). She examines the characteristics of Irish chant as proposed in earlier studies by both Bruno Stäblein and Patrick Brannon, adding to them her examination of the notation in the earliest noted (adiastematic) Irish source, the Drummond Missal (New York, Pierpont Morgan Library, MS M. 627). Her summary suggests that 'repetition, a frequently alternating directional motif, and tertial construction' represent melodic features of early Irish chant similar in style to the Gallican tradition. Bernard Hangartner describes the veneration of the ninth-century Irish monk, St Fintan which is confined to the district of Rheinau. Hangartner gives a brief introduction to each of the six extant chant sources: Zürich, Zentralbibliothek, MSS Rheinau 103, 28, 97, 4, 16, and 157. His comparative examination reveals interesting results with evidence of complete editorial alterations

in at least two of the later sources, Zurich MSS Rh 4 and 16. His discussion is supported by the welcome addition of colour plates from each of the sources.

By contrast, Pieter Mannaerts relates the remarkable dissemination of the cult of St Dymphna not only in Gheel, Belgium, but throughout Europe, manifesting itself in the creation of an office almost three decades after the initial *Vita* was written. Mannaerts adds that her universal appeal, in particular as patron saint of the mentally ill, continued into the later seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries by including her character not only in 'works of fiction and drama' but also in music, for example, the *Oratorio Sancta Dimpna* by Fux (1702).

In the examination of offices for saints, the subsequent section shifts the framework from Continental to Insular sources (Ireland, Scotland, and Wales). Buckley's major contribution opens this section. In her illuminating essay, she gives us the stark truth: 'there is no indication that anything other than individual hymns, collects, and occasional antiphons were composed in honour of local saints in pre-Norman Ireland'. Yet, hymns are a prominent feature in the early Irish liturgy. She documents the repertory of hymns in the principal witnesses, the Antiphonary of Bangor and the Irish *Liber Hymnorum* and assesses the significance of particular items in what may be rare examples of early Irish Offices in the Book of Mulling and the eighth-century Basel Psalter (Basel, Universitätsbibliothek, MS A.VII.3). However, the evidence suggests that no complete saints' offices were created prior to 1100.

Senan Furlong continues the narrative by introducing us to the medieval office of St Patrick. Of course, we would expect that a saint of national and international significance would be amply represented in liturgy and music. Surprisingly, the Office for St Patrick survives only in later sources (the earliest un-notated office dates to the end of the thirteenth century). Furlong surveys the extant liturgical and musical sources relating to St Patrick, identifying twelve in total, of which five are notated. In outlining the various chronological stages of the development of the office he points to the continued importance of the hymn 'Ecce fulget clarissima', which already makes an early appearance in the eleventh-century manuscript, Irish *Liber Hymnorum* (Trinity College Dublin, MS 1441), thus recognizing its 'tremendous impact on the texts for the Office'.

In a seamless manner, the following essay by Patrick Brannon focuses on the Office of St Canice located solely in one of the Irish chant sources (already mentioned in the preceding essay by Furlong), Trinity College Dublin MS 78; the latter is one of four notated sources representing the Irish Use of Sarum, dating to the fifteenth century (MSS 77, 78, 79, 80). Brannon seeks to discern a possible Irish style in the St Canice Office by drawing on Frere's melodic formulae, (summarized in the *Antiphonale Sarisburiense*) as part of a comparative investigation, incorporating two noted

breviaries of Sarum Use in the role of the 'control group', Salisbury Cathedral Library, MS 152 (15th) and Oxford Bodleian Library MS 224 (14th). Surprisingly, his study reveals one unique chant (out of a total of twenty-nine), namely, the Lauds antiphon *Benedictus Dominus*. It would have been very interesting to see some plates from the original manuscripts as part of the discussion here.

There is a shift in location to Scotland and Wales with contributions by Betty I. Knott and Greta-Mary Hair. Knott draws up an intriguing account of textual evidence of Irish influence in the Office of St Kentigern. The peculiar Irish-Latin style of Irish scribes from the early Middle Ages apparently can be detected in this Office; the tell-tale signs include obscure poetic Latin and Greek words. Knott relates that twenty-two of the words can be found in the *Hisperica famina* collection, which is of possible Irish origin, dating to the seventh century. Despite the influential role of St Columba in the conversion of the Scots to Christianity, Hair provides a fascinating account of the complex interplay of political and religious factors that determined the choice of St Andrew as the patron saint of Scotland. In 1072 'the independence of the Scottish Church and the political status of the Scottish kingdom were seriously challenged by the metropolitan of York who claimed jurisdiction over Scotland'. However, in order to avoid invasion and ecclesiastical power by a non-Scottish authority, it was necessary to promote the cult of St Andrew in order to secure national control and 'papal protection'.

Scarcity of primary sources is a recurring theme, as indicated by numerous authors in this collection. Harper identifies just two fourteenth-century liturgical codices containing music from Wales, a pontifical and the well-known 'Penpont Antiphoner'. Many of the themes in Harper's fine essay concerning an indigenous liturgy for Wales resonate with those of pre-Conquest Ireland. She proposes furthering this quest of liturgical relations between the two countries, suggesting that 'our debate needs to be informed by knowledge of the main centres of influence and book production in Ireland'.

Three compelling essays complete the final section. Patricia Rumsey sheds new light on the perception of Compline in the light of the *Navigatio sancti Brendani*, which in turn is followed by Neil Xavier O'Donoghue's exploration of the use of the Eucharistic Chrismal in pre-Conquest Ireland. Unfortunately, no Chrimals survive from Ireland but the evidence suggests a type of 'Eucharistic devotion' characteristic of the early Irish Church. Finally, Liam Tracey's perceptive essay provides a fitting conclusion to the book, bringing the enquiry full circle. In addressing the term 'Celtic rite' (already mentioned by Buckley) he summarises contributions from highly renowned medieval scholars such as Edmund Bishop, Louis Duchesne, and A. A. King, among others. In general, the liturgical link to the Gallican tradition is dominant.

*Ann Buckley (ed.), Music, Liturgy, and the Veneration of Saints of the Medieval Irish Church in a European Context (2017)*

However, Tracey astutely warns ‘the word “Gallican” needs to be used in a much more precise way, indicating when and where in Gaul we are discussing’.

The book is aptly dedicated to Michel Huglo (1921–2012), an extraordinary scholar of medieval chant, chant theory, and liturgy. I would highly recommend this book to medieval musicologists and liturgists. This collection of essays marks a significant contribution to these areas of investigation. What is striking is not only the richness of the legacy left by the medieval Irish saints but its impact on the liturgy, music, culture, and lives of peoples (and institutions) throughout many parts of Europe in the Middle Ages. As Ann Buckley points out, music, in particular, has suffered neglect. Let us hope, therefore, that scholars will continue to seek out, identify, and examine sources containing Proper chants for saints in Insular and Continental manuscripts.

Anne Mannion

Independent Scholar